

Sample: Peer Review Guide

Description: Elevate your essay through collaborative feedback. This guided worksheet helps a peer reviewer provide specific, actionable, and constructive criticism on your compare and contrast essay, focusing on both strengths and areas for improvement.

Peer Review Guide for Compare and Contrast Essays

Reviewer's Name: _____

Essay Author's Name: _____

Instructions for the Reviewer: Your goal is to be a helpful reader, not a critic. Provide specific feedback that the writer can use to improve. Answer all questions thoroughly.

PART 1: First Impressions & The Big Picture

1. **After reading the essay once, summarize the main argument in your own words:**
 - *[This tells the author if their thesis is clear and communicated effectively.]*
 2. **What is the greatest strength of this essay? (e.g., a strong thesis, clear examples, good organization):**
 - *[This builds confidence and reinforces what is working.]*
 3. **Organization & Structure:**
 - What organizational method is used? () Point-by-Point () Block Method
 - Is the structure consistent and easy to follow? () Yes () No
 - **Suggestion:** *[Note any places where you got confused or lost. Suggest where a transition might be needed.]*
-

PART 2: Essential Components (Provide Specific Examples)

4. **Thesis Statement:**
 - Locate the thesis statement and underline it. Is it arguable and specific?
 - () Yes, it makes a clear argument.
 - () It could be stronger. **Suggestion:** *[How could it be more specific or debatable?]*
5. **Analysis & Balance:**
 - **Balance:** Does the essay devote roughly equal attention to both subjects?
 - () Yes () No. **Note:** *[Point out any sections that feel unbalanced.]*

- **Analysis:** Find one place where the author does more than just describe—they analyze the *significance* of a similarity or difference. Quote it below:
 - *"Quote showing analysis here..."*
- Now, find one place that would be stronger with *deeper analysis*. Ask a "So What?" question the author could answer:
 - *Example: "You state that Subject A is faster, but so what? Why does that speed matter in the broader context of your thesis?"*

6. Evidence:

- Is every claim supported by evidence (examples, quotes, facts)?
- () Yes () No. **Note:** *[Point out any unsupported claims.]*

PART 3: Constructive Suggestions for Revision

7. What is the #1 thing the author should do to improve this essay?

- *[Be specific, e.g., "Develop the analysis in the second body paragraph," "Add a transition between paragraphs 3 and 4," "Clarify the thesis statement."]*

8. Sentence-Level Feedback:

- Circle any sentences that are wordy, confusing, or grammatically incorrect.
- Point out one effective sentence that is particularly clear or powerful.

[Download the Full Peer Review Guide with a Marking Rubric and Examples]