

Sample: Peer Review Guide

Description: Elevate your essay through collaborative feedback. This guided worksheet helps a peer reviewer provide specific, actionable, and constructive criticism on your compare and contrast essay, focusing on both strengths and areas for improvement.

□ Peer Review Guide for Compare and Contrast Essays

Reviewer's Name: _____

Essay Author's Name: _____

Instructions for the Reviewer: Your goal is to be a helpful reader, not a critic. Provide specific feedback that the writer can use to improve. Answer all questions thoroughly.

PART 1: First Impressions & The Big Picture

1. **After reading the essay once, summarize the main argument in your own words:**
 - *[This tells the author if their thesis is clear and communicated effectively.]*
 2. **What is the greatest strength of this essay? (e.g., a strong thesis, clear examples, good organization):**
 - *[This builds confidence and reinforces what is working.]*
 3. **Organization & Structure:**
 - What organizational method is used? () Point-by-Point () Block Method
 - Is the structure consistent and easy to follow? () Yes () No
 - **Suggestion:** *[Note any places where you got confused or lost. Suggest where a transition might be needed.]*
-

PART 2: Essential Components (Provide Specific Examples)

4. **Thesis Statement:**
 - Locate the thesis statement and underline it. Is it arguable and specific?
 - () Yes, it makes a clear argument.
 - () It could be stronger. **Suggestion:** *[How could it be more specific or debatable?]*
5. **Analysis & Balance:**
 - **Balance:** Does the essay devote roughly equal attention to both subjects?
 - () Yes () No. **Note:** *[Point out any sections that feel unbalanced.]*

- **Analysis:** Find one place where the author does more than just describe—they analyze the *significance* of a similarity or difference. Quote it below:
 - *"Quote showing analysis here..."*
- Now, find one place that would be stronger with *deeper analysis*. Ask a "So What?" question the author could answer:
 - *Example: "You state that Subject A is faster, but so what? Why does that speed matter in the broader context of your thesis?"*

6. Evidence:

- Is every claim supported by evidence (examples, quotes, facts)?
- () Yes () No. **Note:** *[Point out any unsupported claims.]*

PART 3: Constructive Suggestions for Revision

7. What is the #1 thing the author should do to improve this essay?

- *[Be specific, e.g., "Develop the analysis in the second body paragraph," "Add a transition between paragraphs 3 and 4," "Clarify the thesis statement."]*

8. Sentence-Level Feedback:

- Circle any sentences that are wordy, confusing, or grammatically incorrect.
- Point out one effective sentence that is particularly clear or powerful.

[Download the Full Peer Review Guide with a Marking Rubric and Examples]