

Peer Review & Self-Editing Checklist

Essay Title: _____

Author: _____ Reviewer: _____

Date: _____

Instructions: Rate each item (2 = Strong, 1 = Needs Work, 0 = Missing)

1. Argument Strength (12 points)

Criteria	Score	Notes/Suggestions
Thesis Statement - Clear, specific, debatable claim in introduction	___/2	
Position Consistency - Maintains argument throughout without contradicting	___/2	
Logical Reasoning - Points connect logically and support thesis	___/2	
Depth of Analysis - Goes beyond obvious; shows critical thinking	___/2	
Counterargument - Addresses opposing views and refutes them	___/2	
Conclusion Impact - Reinforces thesis and shows broader significance	___/2	

Category Total: ___/12

2. Evidence Quality (6 points)

Criteria	Score	Notes/Suggestions
Source Credibility - Uses reliable, authoritative sources	___/2	
Evidence Relevance - Every quote/fact directly supports claims	___/2	
Integration - Evidence is introduced, cited, and explained (not dropped in)	___/2	

Category Total: ___/6

3. Organization (6 points)

Criteria	Score	Notes/Suggestions
Introduction Hook - Engaging opening that leads to thesis	___/2	
Paragraph Structure - Each paragraph has clear topic sentence and focus	___/2	
Transitions - Smooth connections between ideas and paragraphs	___/2	

Category Total: ___/6

4. Style & Clarity (4 points)

Criteria	Score	Notes/Suggestions
Sentence Variety - Mixes short and long sentences; avoids repetition	___/2	
Word Choice - Precise, academic language without being overly complex	___/2	

Category Total: ___/4

5. Mechanics (2 points)

Criteria	Score	Notes/Suggestions
Grammar & Spelling - Free from distracting errors	___/1	
Citations & Format - Proper in-text citations and Works Cited/References	___/1	

Category Total: ___/2

Overall Evaluation

Total Score: ____/30

Scoring Guide:

- 27-30 = Excellent (ready to submit)
 - 23-26 = Strong (minor revisions needed)
 - 18-22 = Good (moderate revisions needed)
 - Below 18 = Needs substantial revision
-

Strengths (What works well?)

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

Priority Revisions (What needs improvement?)

High Priority (must fix):

1. _____

2.

Medium Priority (should fix):

1.

2.

Specific Line Edits

Page/Para	Issue	Suggestion

Questions for Author

1.

2.

Self-Editing Tips

First Pass - Big Picture (Argument & Organization)

- Read thesis and conclusion - do they match?
- Check topic sentences - does each paragraph have one clear point?
- Verify every paragraph connects to thesis

Second Pass - Evidence & Analysis

- Highlight all quotes/evidence - is each explained?
- Count sources per section - balanced support?
- Check all citations are present and formatted correctly

Third Pass - Style & Clarity

- Read aloud - catch awkward phrasing
- Circle repeated words/phrases - vary language
- Cut unnecessary words - tighten sentences

Final Pass - Mechanics

- Run spell check

- Verify all names, dates, titles are accurate
 - Check formatting requirements (spacing, font, margins)
-

Peer Review Protocol

For the Reviewer:

- Be specific: Instead of "unclear," write "This sentence is confusing because..."
- Balance criticism with praise
- Focus on helping, not judging
- Ask questions rather than making demands

For the Author:

- Don't defend or explain - listen
- Take notes on feedback
- Ask clarifying questions
- Decide which suggestions to apply (it's your essay)